Best Practices for Efficient Traffic Safety Law Enforcement Programs

Eleonora Papadimitriou, PhD, Senior Research Associate
George Yannis, Professor
Alexandra Laiou, Senior Research Associate

Department of Transportation Planning and Engineering, National Technical University of Athens, Athens, Greece

Objectives

- Identify key elements of the traffic enforcement system to improve road safety.
- Develop a framework of principles and proposals for selected enforcement programs.

Methodology

- Exploit international experience.
- Map current enforcement practices.
- Present an example from Greece.
- Evaluate and prioritize enforcement activities.
Enforcement of Seat Belt Use Worldwide

• Enforcement in combination with efficient informational and public awareness campaigns.

• Mild and continuous enforcement following in time the messages of the awareness campaign.

• Impose seatbelt use through relevant incentives.

• Utilization of warning devices inside the vehicle.

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Enforcement of Drink Driving Worldwide

• Systematic enforcement of the legal blood-alcohol concentration limits.
• Inform drivers on relevant Traffic Police actions.
• Implementation of informational campaigns.
• Promotion of alcohol consumption avoidance before driving.
• Increase of the perceived probability for detecting offenders through the implementation of programmes including:
  ✓ large number of controls
  ✓ unpredictable controls in terms of time and location
  ✓ visible enforcement

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Enforcement of Speeding Worldwide

• Increase the perceived probability for detecting offenders
• Use of fixed means at evident locations and to enforce a significant number of drivers.
• Most common methods for monitoring:
  ✓ parked patrol car
  ✓ moving patrol car
• Use of real and virtual camera devices.

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Principles of Selected Enforcement Programmes

• Intensify enforcement and presence of Traffic Police
• Select appropriate control sites
• Select appropriate control time periods
• More frequent controls and lower fines
• Collect fines effectively

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Principles of Selected Enforcement Programmes

- Operate Traffic Police with the appropriate personnel
- Traffic Police training in new technologies
- Supply Traffic Police with appropriate devices
- Use smart enforcement systems (e.g. cameras, section control)
- Develop drivers’ rehabilitation programmes

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Principles of Selected Enforcement Programmes

• Monitor implementation of enforcement activities
  - Number of traffic controls (speed, alcohol, belt, helmet, etc.)
  - Number of Traffic Police staff performing controls per day, region etc
  - Number of detected offences
  - Number of offences estimated based on surveys, studies etc

• Monitor road safety level
  - Number of road accidents, fatalities, injuries
  - Seat belt-helmet use, number of drunk drivers, speeding drivers
  - Number of offences estimated based on surveys, studies, etc
  - Results of random sampling controls

• Monitor enforcement effectiveness
  - Measure effectiveness using good-practice methods
  - Effectiveness concerning specific offences, road users, areas etc
  - Identification of effective and non-effective enforcement activities

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Road Safety Enforcement Programme Objectives

- Decrease accidents number and severity
- Change of driving attitude
- Decrease of offences
- Increase of perceived enforcement
- Controls at proper predefined locations and time periods

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Seat Belt Enforcement Actions

**Objective**
100% front and rear seat belt use

- Frequent and short campaigns
- Random vehicles’ control
- Rear seat belt enforcement

- Systematic recording of controlled drivers’ and vehicle passengers’ data
- Upgrade control sheet

- Monitor offences
- Publish enforcement results

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Drink Driving Enforcement Actions

Objective
20% of drivers controlled each year

Random vehicles’ control
Emphasis on controls in times and locations with increased probability of drink driving

Record controlled drivers’ data, day, time and location of control
Upgrade control sheet

Monitor offences
Publish enforcement results

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
**Objective**

25% of drivers controlled each year

---

**Supporting mechanism for monitoring actions**

Define realistic speed limits

---

**Upgrade controls’ and offences’ recording system**

Record overall number of vehicles passing through control points

---

**Publish number of controls and offences**

Publish individual data of offenders (gender, age, driving experience, etc.)

---

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
International experience

- Cost-benefit analysis results for road safety enforcement in different countries are very satisfactory for all types of enforcement schemes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enforcement scheme</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>B/C ratio range</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Concentrated general enforcement</td>
<td>Israel</td>
<td>3.5 – 5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tripling stationary speed enforcement</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tripling alcohol and seat belt enforcement</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>1.2 – 3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increasing alcohol controls</td>
<td>Sweden and Norway</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increasing speed controls</td>
<td>Sweden and Norway</td>
<td>2.0 – 8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section automatic speed control on motorways</td>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Red light violations enforcement cameras</td>
<td>Scotland</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Red light violations enforcement cameras</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol enforcement + publicity campaign</td>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased road safety enforcement + publicity campaign</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>3.9 – 7.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risky driving enforcement + publicity campaign</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: ROSEBUD (2005)*
## Greece: Control vs Violations Efficiency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1998</th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2002</th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Road Fatalities</strong></td>
<td>2.182</td>
<td>2.116</td>
<td>2.088</td>
<td>1.895</td>
<td>1.654</td>
<td>1.605</td>
<td>1.670</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Drink &amp; Drive Controls</strong></td>
<td>202.161</td>
<td>246.611</td>
<td>365.611</td>
<td>710.998</td>
<td>1.034.502</td>
<td>1.271.273</td>
<td>1.281.102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Drink &amp; Drive Violations</strong></td>
<td>13.996</td>
<td>17.665</td>
<td>30.507</td>
<td>49.464</td>
<td>48.947</td>
<td>45.546</td>
<td>40.986</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Greece: Controls vs Behaviour Change

Greece: Modelling the effect of enforcement

- Data on road accidents / fatalities from the National Statistical Service of Greece
- Data on enforcement (controls, violations) and related costs from the Greek Police
- Cluster analysis of the 52 prefectures of Greece, based on road network, population density, vehicle ownership, traffic violations and accidents - 4 groups identified
- Poisson regression models for road safety in Greece in relation to enforcement, vehicles fleet, vehicle ownership, population:
  - Models with no time halo effect of enforcement ("conservative" scenario)
  - Models with a time halo effect of enforcement ("best" scenario)
- The effect of enforcement was significant in Groups II & IV

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Greece: Cost-Benefit analysis

• Calculation of accident socioeconomic cost in Greece: willingness-to-pay for accident risk reduction in Greece

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Conservative scenario</th>
<th>Best Scenario</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of accidents prevented</td>
<td>772</td>
<td>1,142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average accident cost (€)</td>
<td>128,972</td>
<td>128,972</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Present value of benefits (€)</td>
<td>107,980,919</td>
<td>159,681,549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of speed enforcement (€)</td>
<td>14,814,729</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of alcohol enforcement (€)</td>
<td>24,709,862</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Enforcement Cost (€)</td>
<td>39,524,591</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefit - Cost Ratio</td>
<td>2.73</td>
<td>4.04</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Conclusions

• A decrease in road accidents number and severity is achieved through the substantial change in driving behaviour and offence reduction.

• Increase of the perceived enforcement is achieved by frequent controls at many sites of the road network focusing on risk locations and hours.

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Conclusions

• Effective enforcement programmes are reached through:
  ✓ increasing intensity of programs
  ✓ systematic monitoring
    (enforcement intensity, offences, driving behaviour)
  ✓ integrated communication policy
    (coordination with other actions, publishing actions and results)
  ✓ developing conscious safety culture for drivers
    (implement remedial programmes for recidivists, adopt point system)

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Further Recommendations

• Enforcement should always be combined with the respective campaigns at national and local level.

• Collaboration on a regular basis between Traffic Police and relevant Experts (transportation engineers, communication specialists, psychologists, etc.)

• Publishing on a regular basis of control figures and their results in order to ensure the active commitment and involvement of road safety stakeholders.

• Study the specific features of each enforcement action (residential - non residential areas, time, day, vehicle type, etc.)

NTUA, Eleonora Papadimitriou, nopapadi@central.ntua.gr
Best Practices for Efficient Traffic Safety Law Enforcement Programs

Eleonora Papadimitriou, PhD, Senior Research Associate
George Yannis, Professor
Alexandra Laiou, Senior Research Associate

Department of Transportation Planning and Engineering, National Technical University of Athens, Athens, Greece